

**Ministry of Higher Education (MoHE)**  
**Higher Education Development Program (HEDP)**  
**Operations and Monitoring Support Team (OMST)**

**Bi monthly Progress Monitoring Report**

**Reporting Period: July and August 2019**

**Reporting Date: 1st September 2019**

**Submitted by: Operation and Monitoring Support Team (OMST)**

## Contents

Acronym .....	iii
A. Executive Summary .....	1
B) Component One Activities:.....	2
Theme1.1: Increasing Access to Priority Degree Program for Economic Development.....	2
Theme1.2: Modernizing and Enhancing the Quality of Teaching and Learning.....	3
Theme 1.2.2: Information and Communications Technology Enhanced Teaching and Learning.....	3
Theme1.3: Improving the Qualification and Skills of Academic and Technical Staff Members .....	3
Theme 1.4: Strengthening Governance, Quality Assurance and Accreditation.....	7
C) Component Two: Program Operations and Technical Support .....	10
Physical Infrastructure Projects .....	10
Financial Management.....	13
Human Resource Management .....	13
Monitoring and Evaluation .....	14
D) Challenges and Recommendations .....	14
Annex A: Intermediate Outcome Indicators Status for 2019 based on the revised PIM .....	16

## Acronym

ANASTU	Afghanistan National Agriculture Science and Technology University
DLI	Disbursement Linked Indicator
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
HEDP	Higher Education Development Project
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IQA	Internal Quality Assurance
IQAU	Internal Quality Assurance Unit
IT	Information Technology
KMU's	Kabul Medical University
QAA	Quality Assurance and Accreditation
KPU	Kabul Polytechnic University
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MoHE	Ministry of Higher Education
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NEPA	National Environmental Protection Agency
OBE	Outcome Based Education
OMST	Operation Monitoring and Support Team
QAAD	Quality Assurance and Accreditation Directorate
SCL	Student-Centered Learning
SIDP	Strategic Institutional Development Plan
SZU	Shaikh Zayed University (Khost)
WB	World Bank

## A. Executive Summary

This bi-monthly report covers the last program of the program for the months of July and August 2019, along with the cumulative progress for each thematic area. During this reporting period, the WB mission was conducted and the technical papers and aid memoire have been shared with the stakeholder. The program will focus on achieving the agreed actions until the next mission. The updated result framework indicates that all three PDO indicators including the target values of 7 intermediate indicators have been achieved. In respect to the agreed actions of the recent WB mission, the program is on track and progressing well. There have almost 7 agreed actions needed prompt response of the program with the close deadline (August 2019). It now appears that some of them are not achieved. a proposal for managing Component 2 within the current budget ceiling of US\$ 11 million up to the end of the project, and expedition of leadership training process with MoHE and NITTTR are among them. In addition to that, the fiduciary and social safeguard related issues pending from the last mission are still not cleared. No progress seems in respect to the deed preparation for the 11 project affected families in Bamyan. The leadership training seems to be delayed into 2020, or very end of 2019, where the 2019 target value associated with this theme won't be achieve. The list of participants for this training is yet to be finalized in MoHE. *The agreed actions tracker is attached as annex 1.*

During the reporting period, the concealing centers of Kabul and Kabul education universities were inaugurated by H.E the Minister and MoHE and universities officials. These two centers are now functional, while the Balkh and Bamyan universities' concealing centers however are established but not inaugurated yet. the child care centers of Bamyan university is 95% completed, in addition, the process of designing the renovation of child care center in Albironi and Parwan Universities has been started. The Water and Lavatories projects in 4 universities (Ghazni, Herat, Paktiya and Panjshir) have been completed and are utilized, and the physical work of two others (Kunduz and Balkh) are under Progress. More than 5,300 first year's female students are enrolled in priority disciplines. The new enrollment data is getting received from universities, will be updated in the next report. With respect to the PDCs Lead Capacity Development, the program has conducted the training program at the Amity University, India from 26<sup>th</sup> 18<sup>th</sup> August and will continue till 12<sup>th</sup> September 2019. The physical work of two ICT projects, one IT project is smoothly running and are near to the completion. 13 IT equipment projects are in the evaluation process and will be awarded soon. The program works with universities to fill all the vacant position of technicians at ICTs to ensure the functionality of seven ICT centers by December 2019.

The M&E unit of the program along with scholarships technical team conducted a feasibility study of HEDP scholarships. The data provided in the report indicates that the program may not be able to achieve the 2022 DLI target (Completion of 350 Scholarships by 2021). The data as well indicates that however, by end of 2020 the program might have 257 completed scholarships (18 scholarships behind the 2021 DLI target (275), It can be manageable with the alternative solutions presented in the following report, so it seems not to be a headache for the program. From the other hands, it was agreed in the mission that all pending students must be enrolled by December 2019, it now appears not possible. the data provided in table #3 indicates that the program might place 43 master degree students out of 109 pending, and 23 PhD students out of 53 by December 2019. The data as well indicates that there are almost 33 students who need English bridging course, while being placed at February 2020. These students increase the likelihood of not getting completed by 2022. In the last report, it was mentioned if all pending students are enrolled by September 2019, the DLI target of 2022, including the intermediate outcome indicator's value would be met. With the delay in placement, the risk associated with this thematic area increases. During the last two months, the program facilitated, organized and conducted a 10-day short term lab technical and maintenance training held at Kabul and Kabul Medical universities. from 22-30 June 2019. In this training, 151 lab technicians were trained. The program is planning an impact study of this training to be conducted by December 2019.

Recently, the program has awarded 55 research projects with composition of 12 Group and 43 Individual. The list of awarded projects will be soon shared with WB for the NoL. With the award of this number projects, the total research projects awarded up to date reaches to 152, while the end line target for this theme is to award 145 project by 2020. The program has facilitated the external review of 29 universities which includes 16 private and 13 publics. In end of August, the program initiated the external peer review of six more universities. It's expected that the review will get finished by Mid-September 2019. As the IQAUs is being established at nine universities, the IQAUs lead of these universities were trained. The program's low budget execution rate standing at 25% is a challenge at this time. The contract registry attached as annex 5 shows that the program is due for almost 2.6 Million USD against the expired contracts. With respect to the procurement, the program needs to resolve the technical issue of library books and lab equipment projects pending for more than two years. technical issues. They are in uncertain condition now.

## B) Component One Activities:

### Theme 1.1: Increasing Access to Priority Degree Program for Economic Development

Since last report, there is no progress in the enrollment data. This has been an annual frequency indicator updating once each year, after the new students are enrolled in the public universities. In the WB mission, it was agreed to report the enrollment data based on the original priority disciplines list. Based on the original priority list, the total number of students in priority disciplines stands at 81,984 which exceed the annual target of 80,500. In respect to the DLI target, the number of female students enrolled at first year priority degree programs stands at 5,348 confirmed by the TPV firm. This number surpasses the 2019 DLI target of 5,000. Considering the two targets achieved for this thematic area of the program, it can be stated that the program progresses well in this area. For the 2019 intake, MoHE allotted 5,576 seats for female students in priority disciplines. The new enrollment data will be revealed in next report.

Table 1: Students Enrollment in Higher Education at Public Universities by 2018

Indicators	By 2018		
	Female	Male	Total
<b>First Year Enrollment in Priority Disciplines</b> (Intermediate Outcome Indicator, DLI I)	5,348	18,861	<b>24,209</b>
<b>Total Enrollment in Priority Disciplines</b> (Project Development Indicator)	16,935	65,049	<b>81,984</b>

Note: The data presented at this table is based on original PD. The revised PD list indicates that the numbers are far more than this.

### **Measures to Promote Female Enrolment in Public Universities.**

During the reporting period, the physical work of ongoing projects progressed well and the two concealing centers of Kabul and Kabul Education universities were inaugurated by H.E The Minister and other officials. The program has had a satisfactory progress on the various initiatives supporting the promotion of female enrollment in higher education.

**Child Care Centers:** In terms of child care centers and concealing centers, the program continued on expanding the child care centers into more public universities. Two child care centers were already established and functioning in Kabul and Kabul medical universities by MoHE and HEDP. during the reporting period, the physical work of Takhar child care centers has been completed as 100%, while the child care centers of Bamyan university is 95% completed. The process of designing the renovation of child care center in Albironi and Parwan Universities has been started.

**On the counselling centers,** the program has already established four counseling centers at KEU, Balkh, KU and Bamyan universities. During the reporting period, the procurement process of the renovation of counselling center at Herat University has been started. The Water and Lavatories projects in 4 universities (Ghazni, Herat, Paktiya and Panjshir) have been completed and are utilized, while the physical work of two others (Kunduz and Balkh) are under Progress. In addition, the water and lavatories in four more universities (KU, KMU, Farah and Samangan) are planned for 2019, the initial procurement steps have been started.

**The disadvantageded scholarships** have been expanded to 300 now. KU, KEU, Herat and Balkh Universities have been included to the list of KMU and KPU for awarding these scholarships. The first round of 2,500 AFs stipends were distributed starting from the month of September 2018 in two universities (KMU, KPU) and the stipend distribution of the rest of universities is in process. Through this initiative, MoHE would like to promote female retentions from disadvantageded background. The program has planned 14 universities to conduct orientation programs for first year female students in 2019. They are KU, KMU, KPU, KEU, Nangarhar, Herat, Balkh, Kandahar, Khost, Paktiya, Albironi, Badakhshan, Bamyan, and Jawzjan Universities.

## Theme1.2: Modernizing and Enhancing the Quality of Teaching and Learning

### *Theme 1.2.1: Outcome Based Education and Student-Centered Learning*

The program planned, organized and conducted PDC Leads Training Program at Amity University, India from 26 August and will continue to 12th September 2019. In this training 12 PDC leads have participated and the purpose of the training is to assist the PDC Leads to learn about the strategies and techniques of how a PDC is run and led effectively and moreover to enhance their skills and knowledge on how workshops and training programs are initiated out of a PDC.

The program has already achieved the 2019 target in OBE-SCL, up to date, 1803 public universities academic members have been trained in OBE-SCL, while the last survey administered by the program indicates that 1246 practice the OBE-SC. The program will continue the expansion of training to cover the remaining academic members at 24 public universities. In addition, the program started taking into consideration a plan and coordination with Academic Programs Development & Private Higher Education Institutions Directorate on how to expand OBE-SCL training programs to both public and private higher education institutions in the near future.

The last ISM's technical paper indicates that there have been seven agreed actions associated with this thematic area of the program. The progress on these agreed actions will be reflected in future reporting. Up to date, no tangible progress appears in respect to the agreed actions. The program has trained 211 Department heads, and the training will cover the remaining heads too. In addition, the these, three PDCs are planned to be established by 2019.

### *Theme 1.2.2: Information and Communications Technology Enhanced Teaching and Learning*

During the months of July and August 2019, MoHE with technical support of HEDP has planned a short term technical and maintenance training program title as "the e-learning course development under Graphic Design" targeting 23 IT and Media staff of MoHE. The Concept Note and ToR for the workshop is developed, will shortly be shared with bank for NOL. In addition, the program has coordinated and followed with MoHE on the recruitment of ICT technicians for the ICTs established or/and those being established. This will ensure that the program has 7 functional ICTs by 2019 to meet the DLI target value of next year.

However, the program has achieved the 2019 target for ICTs, the program is on track on establishing more ICTs and IT equipment facilities into public universities to achieve the 2020 DLI target. Currently, a number of ICTs and IT equipment projects are in different phases under this theme. The physical work of two ICT centers of Bamyan and Kabul Medical universities and IT Center of Baghlan university are in the implementation progress. In addition, the procurement process of establishing IT Center of Alberoni university has been finalized. This project is awarded to Khalij technology firm, and they will commence the physical work soon. The KPU ICT center is processed through NPA and is under announcement phase by now. regarding the IT equipment projects, 13 IT equipment projects are currently in the final stage of procurement phase. The evaluation process of 4 out of 13 IT equipment projects (Helmand, Panjshir, Logar, and Ghour) universities are completed and 9 out of 13 (Urozgan, Saripul, Farah, Badghis, Paktika, Kandahar, Herat, Nangarhar, and Jawzjan) are in evaluation process.

## Theme1.3: Improving the Qualification and Skills of Academic and Technical Staff Members

### *Theme 1.3.1: Scholarships for Masters Degrees in Priority Disciplines*

So far 476 master's and PhD scholarships have been awarded to academic members of different universities from across the country. Out of this total number, 304 applicants have been enrolled in different master's programs. Hence, out of 304 MA scholarship holders, 116 applicants have completed their programs and returned home, while 6 have dropped (1 death case, 2 escaped to other countries to seek asylum and 3 has returned due to illness without completing the program). The remaining 181 scholarships are in progress and will complete in the coming year(s). Seemingly, the program has exceeded the intermediate outcome indicator's target value of (400 Awarded scholarships). Currently, the program is focusing on the placement and completion of the master scholarships awarded since 2016.

This report provides the data and analysis on when, where and how the pending 160 students (53 PhD and 111 Master degree) will be placed and how the target values associated with scholarships will be achieved/not achieved. In 2019, the program identified 86 academic members of faculties for the master degree scholarships in priority programs. From 86 master scholarships, 27 are females and the rest are males. The WB NoL was issued almost two months ago. Since then, no tangible progress appears in respect to the placement and enrollment due to the difference in academic calendars of foreign universities. In 2019, the program has placed 2 students related to batch 2018, while the students of batch 2019 haven't been placed so far. Considering the time limitation of the project, there are serious questions with respect to the achievement of the target values specified for theme 1.3.1: will the program be able to achieve the DLI targets of 2021 and 2022, which are 275 and 350 scholarships for each year respectively? How much is it certain that the placement of all 160 pending applicants will be carried out by 2019 to ensure the achievement of end line target value for this theme (400 scholarships completed by December 21st, 2022)? What if there are some scholarship withdrawal cases in these 160 students? If so, what's the Plan B? The number of scholarships in none-priority degree programs and how they affect the achievement of DLI and other target values? The report provides recommendations and alternative solutions in the following sections.

In respect to the DLIs, data provided in the table 2 indicates that the program will have 257 completed scholarships by December, 2020, with 18 scholarships behind the target. However, given that the TPV firm usually conducts their study during June-July of each year, we will be able to have 20 more graduates by July 2021, which will help us exceed the set target. Providing that the firm is procured before July 2021, then the other two DLI's can be verified and the scholarships DLI should be verified after some delay. Having said the above scenarios, the program can conclude that 2021 DLI's are manageable and can be achieved. In regards to the 2022 DLI, the program doesn't seem to be on track. The data provided in table 3 indicates that majority of 2019 master degree students will be enrolled in February 2020. This will affect the 2022 DLI target negatively. If majority of 2019 scholarships are placed in February 2020, then their expected graduation date will be July/August 2022, which will negatively affect the 2022 targets and DLI's. Hence, we can infer that the 2022 DLI is not achievable.

Table 2: Updated Scholarships Aggregated data (2016-2018 actual, 2019-2023 prediction)

Program	Year	Scholarships Awarded Cumulative Data			Placement/Enrollment Cumulative Data			Expected Graduation Cumulative Data			Remarks
		Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	
Master	2016	68	35	103	68	32	100	-	-	-	Actual
Master	2017	133	76	209	132	62	194	-	-	-	Actual
Master	2018	217	119	336	209	95	304	65	21	86	Actual
Master	2019	276	148	424	237	110	347	88	39	127	Prediction
Master	2020	-	-	-	279	138	417	173	84	257	Prediction
Master	2021	-	-	-	-	-	-	205	93	298	Prediction
Master	2022	-	-	-	-	-	-	275	136	411	Prediction
<b>Total Master</b>		<b>276</b>	<b>148</b>	<b>424</b>	<b>279</b>	<b>138</b>	<b>417</b>	<b>275</b>	<b>136</b>	<b>411</b>	
PhD	2019	36	17	53	36	17	53	-	-	-	Annual Data
PhD	2023-2024	-	-	-	-	-	-	36	17	53	Annual Data
Total PhD		36	17	53	36	17	53	36	17	53	Annual Data
<b>Grand Total</b>		<b>312</b>	<b>165</b>	<b>477</b>	<b>315</b>	<b>155</b>	<b>470</b>	<b>311</b>	<b>153</b>	<b>464</b>	

Note: The expected graduation figures are valid, if all pending 160 students are placed at least by Feb 2020.

#### Placement of Pending Students (Master and PhD)

The program is now dealing with the placement of almost 160 students (24 students of 2018 batch, 51 PhD and 85 Master degree students of 2019). It was predicted that a great portion of the pending students will be placed by September 2019, but considering the current progress, it looks impossible. This delay in the placement negatively impacts the program. In the last report, and the data provided for Implementation

Support Mission, it appeared as if the values of all indicators will be achieved, on condition that all pending students get enrolled by September/October 2019. There are two main reasons behind this delay:

1. The academic calendar of the universities selected by MoHE, indicates that their first year semesters start at August/September and February each year. When the scholarships award process took much time, the September admission was missed.
2. Receiving Admission from universities, processing Passports and Visas is time consuming. The program tried to grab the September semester, but found that many students had to get their passports and then the visa process takes longer time.

One of the challenges for the program was the placement of medical students of the last beaches and the same for 2019. The program has found a suitable university (Al-Farabi)/Kazakhstan where almost 19 students will be placed at October 2019. The admission for these students has been issued by the university.

Table 3. Master and PhD student's placement plan, 2019.

Program	Batch	Identified University	Time Table					Program Duration	Expected Graduation Date
			Aug	Sep	Oct	Jan	Feb		
Master Degree Program	2018 Batch	LPU	2					2.5 Years	1-Feb-22
		Al-Farabi (Medical Students)			19			2.5 Years	1-Apr-22
		KATEB University					3	2.5 Years	1-Aug-22
		LPU		3				2.5 Years	1-Mar-22
		Indoor (Public Uni)		2	2			2.5 Years	1-Mar-22
		Al-Farabi			15			2.5 Years	1-Apr-22
		UTM					33	2.5 Years	1-Aug-22
		UPM					14	2.5 Years	1-Aug-22
		IUM					6	2.5 Years	1-Aug-22
		UiTM					1	2.5 Years	1-Aug-22
		KMUTT					6	2.5 Years	1-Aug-22
		ISM					3	2.5 Years	1-Aug-22
PhD Program	2019 Batch	IUM		5				3 - 4 Years	2023
		UTM		3	8			3 - 4 Years	2023
		UITM		3	1			3 - 4 Years	2023
		UPM		3				3 - 4 Years	2023
		MAHIDOL					4	3 - 4 Years	2023-2024
		IIT-Roorkee					12	3 - 4 Years	2023-2024
		IIT- Bombay					8	3 - 4 Years	2023-2024
		IIT- Kharagpur					6	3 - 4 Years	2023-2024
<b>Total by Month</b>			<b>2</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>96</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>160</b>

### Scholarships withdrawal:

Based on the lessons learned from the past years, and the recent cases received from some students, the program predicts that 90% of the 160 students will be placed as described in the table 3. We recently received four PhD scholarship withdrawals from Kabul, Parwan, Bamyán universities due to the following reasons:

- Some have found other scholarships and have already started the process with them.
- There has been one case of pregnancy who will not be able to go due to her sickness.

In order to be in safe side, the following recommendations are suggested.

The pogrom must have a plan B for the master degree scholarships. Some 30 new students (20 from the APTES list and 10 new female) must be identified. The process of receiving steering committee endorsement and the NoL of world Bank should be received in advance. As described above that the likelihood of conciliation for female students is high, the program must grab at least 10 new female students to meet the female ratio (33%). In addition to this, the program must as well send an official letter to all targeted universities that the academic members awarded with the HEDP scholarships shouldn't take part in other scholarships.

### Completion of the master scholarships placed at 2019.

From the APTIS score sheet, it appears that 34 students have obtained lower score than B2 (B1, A2, A1), they are automatically referred to the English bridging course. These 34 students have been introduced into Malaysian and Thailand universities. From the table 3, it appears that they are enrolled in Jan/Feb 2019. If these 34 students start their English bridging course, there is a high risk that they will not be able to complete their courses by 2022. This will negatively impact the program in terms of achieving 2022 outcome level target value (400 master scholarships to be completed by 2022). The M&E team proposes the following alternative for the program.

- These students must be referred to some English preparation courses inside the country. They have at least four to five months in the country. In this period, the students can learn some English skills and will be somehow prepared for the English test taken by these universities.
- The program can discuss with these universities to enroll the students directly to their master courses and at the same time, they can study their bridging courses in part time. This will enable us with the saving of time.
- As the degree attestation is a lengthy process and take much time, the OMST/MoHE can officially communicate with the targeted universities to issue a temporary completion certificate to all those who complete their scholarships. This will help with the TPV firm having access to the supporting document (evidences) while the TPV is being conducted.

### Scholarships in none-priority areas

Looking at all fields of study for Master degree programs, we found that 11 scholarships associated with 2017 and 2018 batches are enrolled in none-priority programs. We sought if they are replaced at universities after they are enrolled in priority programs, but found that they were originally enrolled in these field and the WB has issued NoL for both batches as a whole. It will not impact negatively the program in terms of achieving the targets in priority degree programs, as the program will have 11 extra master scholarships than the planned one (400 master scholarships). *The WB NoLs are attached as annex 2a and 2b.*

Table 4: Number of scholarships awarded and placed at none priority degree programs

NO	Faculty	Enrolled in 2017 Batch			Enrolled in 2018 Batch			Grand Total
		Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	
14	Journalism	1		1	2		2	3
15	Arts		1	1			0	1
16	Psychology		4	4		1	1	5
17	Geography		1	1			0	1
18	Sharayat		0	0		1	1	1
	<b>Total</b>	1	6	7	2	2	4	11

### Theme 1.3.2. Short-term Technical and Maintenance Courses for Technical Staff in Universities

During the reporting period, the program successfully conducted the short term technical training in two rounds. The first round short term library technical and maintenance training was conducted at ACKU for the library technicians. The total of 166 library technicians from 24 public universities and 10 higher institutes were trained with a composition of 24% female. The training was conducted for 8-days from 22-30 June at ACKU. Furthermore, the second round training of short term lab technical and maintenance

training was conducted at Kabul and Kabul Medical universities. In total, 153 lab technician participated from 20 public universities, five different disciplines e.g. Medical (27 Participants), Engineering (53 Participants), Agriculture (25 Participants), Veterinary (12 Participants), and Science/Education (36 Participants). The gender disaggregated data indicates that 75% of the participants were male, while the rest were female. The feedback survey shows that 72% of the participants were satisfied with the training contents and delivery approach. The proposed course aimed to equip the lab and library technicians with the required skills to have laboratories and libraries in the universities being managed more professionally in order to ensure better research outputs and the utilization, fixing and maintenance of resources cost-efficiently and effectively. *The training detailed report is attached as annex 3.*

*Table 5: Number of short term technical staff trained under HEDP since 2016*

S/N	Type of training	Beneficiaries	Number of Staff trained	Year
1	Gender Mainstreaming Workshop	Gender Focal Points, Vice Chancellors, and HR	21	29-Oct-16
2	National Seminar Enhancing Women Participation in Higher Education	Gender Focal Points, Vice Chancellors, and HR	85	30-Jul-17
4	Short term ICTs Technical and Maintenance Training	ICT Technicians	21	21-Sep-18
5	Short term Libraries Technical and Maintenance Training	Libraries Technicians	166	22-Jun-19
6	Short term Lab Technical and Maintenance Training	Lab Technicians	153	14-Jul-19
Total			446	

The above table indicates that the program has achieved the end line target value for this thematic area (400 technical staff to be trained by 2022). The program will conduct an impact evaluation by the end of 2019 and will share it with the stakeholder in order to inform the future actions and plans.

#### Theme 1.4: Strengthening Governance, Quality Assurance and Accreditation

##### *Theme 1.4.1: Strategic Institutional Development Plans (SIDPs)*

As of now, the the MoHE SPIC seems to have significantly progressed in reviewing the universities' SIDP's. The MoHE SPIC is currently busy with the review and feedback process for all the 25 universities in plan for 2019. So far over 20 SIDP's out of 25 have been reviewed thoroughly and the universities are provided constructive feedbacks. Subsequently, out of the 20 reviewed SIDP's, 10 universities have resent their very final draft for final approval from the MoHE SPIC.

In addition, it was discussed during the mission that a policy document should be developed to help the MoHE institutionalize the SIDP's and APR's at universities; hence, the committee have started their initial discussions about the policy document and one of the committee members has been assigned to first prepare a draft policy document. The committee will then work seriously to enrich the draft policy document and change it into a living MoHE document.

##### *Annual Progress Reports (APR's)*

This is a one-time activity, which usually takes place at the end of the year. Therefore, so far there is no progress report on this activity. There will be a progress report by end of year 2019, when the universities issue their Annual Progress report (APR). During the last year (2018), 6 universities issued their annual progress reports on their SIDPs. These six universities who presented on their APR's were selected based on the target set for 2018 in the PIM. The program has achieved the target set for this theme for 2018 (6

APRs to be issued). Once the universities get their SIDP's approved by the MoHE, they have to report annually on the progress they have made towards the strategic objectives set in their SIDP's. This report is called Annual Progress Report (APR's). The program is on track to achieve the target of 2019 on this theme.

#### *Theme 1.4.2: Internal Quality Assurance*

With having 9 IQAUs already established, the physical work of establishing 8 additional IQAUs is almost finalized and will be soon completed. The 2019 TPV report verified functionality of 6 IQAUs and that the 2019 DLI target associated to this theme which has been six functional IQAUs, is achieved. Analyzing the report of the 2019 TPV and previous TPV, we noted that the IQAU scorecard needs revision and interpretation for its criteria, because some of the criteria are ambiguous and sometimes misleading. OMST plans to review and revise the IQAU scorecard in collaboration with the QAAD and other stakeholders.

During this reporting period the OMST has organized a training program for the IQAU Leads of the universities where IQAUs are planned to be established. This is the first time that the Quality Assurance training is happening in Afghanistan, which was previously provided by the MQA of Malaysia.

#### *Theme 1.4.3: External Quality Assurance*

For external quality assurance or the accreditation, the program target is to review 30 universities in 2019. Till now at different stages the OMST has facilitated review of 29 universities which includes 16 private and 13 public universities. OMST has just initiated review of 6 universities which will be completed in September. With completing the review of 6 universities in September the total number of reviewed universities will reach 33 because 2 universities are being focused review which were previously reviewed but not accredited. The 6 universities are; 1) Karwan, 2) Bakhtar, 3) Kurshaid, 4) Danish, 5) Alberoni, 6) Paktia. Among the 29 reviewed universities, 6 universities got Grade A accreditation and 11 universities got Grade B accreditation. Details of the universities reviewed is available in the following table.

Table 6: Updated status of 23 externally reviewed universities (13 Private, 10 Public)

Private Universities			Public Universities		
S/N	Universities	Review Result	S/N	Universities	Review Result
1	AUAF	Grade A	1	Kabul	Grade A
2	Kardan	Grade A	2	Balkh	No Accreditation
3	Kateb	Grade A	3	Kabul Polytechnic	No Accreditation
4	Khatam-al-Nabiyeen	No Accreditation	4	Kandahar	Grade A
5	RANA	Grade B	5	Kabul Medical	Grade A
6	Ibne Sina	Grade B	6	Kabul Education	No Accreditation
7	Cheragh Medical	Grade B	7	Sheikh Zayed	No Accreditation
8	Karwan	No Accreditation	8	Herat	No Accreditation
9	Bakhtar	No Accreditation	9	Nangarhar	No Accreditation
10	Maryam	No Accreditation	10	Takhar	No Accreditation
11	Ghalib Kabul	Grade B	11	Jawzjan	No Accreditation
12	Ghalib Heart	Grade B	12	Helmand	Grade B
13	Salaam	Grade B	13	Parwan	Grade B
14	Alfalah	Grade B			
15	Gharjistan University	Grade B			

16	Maulan Jalaluddin Mohammada Balkhi	Grade B	
----	---------------------------------------	---------	--

OMST has just completed training and internship program for the 20 recently selected EPRs. This will increase the total number of the trained EPRs to 54. It's worth mentioning that this is the first time the EPRs are being trained in Afghanistan by our own experienced EPRs.

OMST organized a national accreditation award ceremony, where the accreditation certificates were officially awarded to the 6 Grade A accredited university. A video outlining the process and achievements in the quality assurance and accreditation was developed and played at this ceremony to further promote the quality assurance and accreditation.

We are in the progress of institutional assessment of the QAAD through UNESCO, to guide us on the future development and streamlining our quality assurance and accreditation with the regional quality assurance and accreditation agencies. UNESCO did submit the inception report and started data collection. As per the contract, it's expected that UNESCO will submit an institutional development plan to the MoHE by end of 2019.

#### *Theme 1.4.4: Leadership and Management Courses for Senior Managerial and Administrative Staff*

The program has negotiated organizing the advanced leadership training for the NRPs with different organization including NEIPA of India, UNESCO Bangkok, Mahidol University and NITTTR of India. They all declined to conduct this training for the NRPs except NITTTR. As of now, we have received the commitment of the NITTTR to organize this training on October 14th. The list of the attendees is still not endorsed by the MoHE's. this issues have been included to the steering committee's agenda scheduled for the third week of September 2019. If the list is endorsed, then the training is expected to be conducted at mid October 2019. OMST is working on the internal processes for arrangement of the NRPs travel to India to participate at this training. Upon return of the NRPs, the OMST will plan for the cascading the leadership training programs for other public university leadership and management staff.

#### *Theme 1.5: Stimulating Development Oriented Research (DLI)*

The research work seems to be well ahead of the plan. After the establishment of the new research directorate and a highly qualified technical research committee, there has been significant progress. The Technical Research Committee started developing new policies, procedures and regulations for the review of research proposals before starting the review process for 2019 round of proposals. The committee also revised the scoring rubric and the research proposal selection criteria through a series of meetings before the review process.

For 2019, a total of 210 proposals were received from across the country for research grants, out of which 65 were individual research proposals and 145 were group proposals. With respect to female researchers, we had only 3 female individual proposals and a total of 55 female researchers involved in all group research proposals. The committee completed reviewing all these proposals with very much accuracy and each proposals was reviewed by at least 2 committee members. After the complete review, 55 best research proposals were selected, out of which 43 are individual research proposals and 12 are group. While selecting these proposals, the committee members were instructed to consider a balance by discipline and gender in addition to the proposals' quality.

The final list of 55 selected proposals (12 group and 43 individual) is prepared and under process for H.E minister's approval. As soon as the H.E minister's approval is obtained, it will be sent to the World Bank

for NoL. HEDP has awarded 97 research projects to different public and private university's professors since 2016, which out of the total projects awarded, 53 research projects have been completed.

### C) Component Two: Program Operations and Technical Support

#### *Social and Environmental Safeguard*

During the period under review, the social and environmental team has conducted the following activities;

- A training workshop conducted on environment, social safeguard, and grievance redress mechanism (GRM) for the university staff of the 30 local universities. (16th to 18th July 2019). the purpose of this training was to introduce participants to the ESMF, RPF, ESMP, RAP, GRM, WB Social Safeguard Policies and Role & Responsibilities of GRCs. The report of the training has been shared with the Bank SGs team.
- Follow-up made on the acceleration of the deed preparation to the 11 project affected families in Bamyan province. The final decision made in this case is that the Bamyan municipality will provide the affected families with the deeds once they pay the required cost for the residential services.
- The final reports of the third party (MSI) who were assigned for the HEDP infrastructures projects inspection, have submitted to the Bank for the month of July.
- Follow-up made with the Malaysia embassy regarding provision of a death certificate for Mohammad Iqbal Haidary, HEDP master scholar who has died due to a traffic accident. The report will be shared soon when received.

#### Procurement

During the period under review, the procurement unit of HEDP was engaged with the procurement directorate of MoHE to facilitate the procurement process of several HEDP projects such as ICT, Water and lavatories specially for girls, establishment of IQAUs and PDCs, establishment of concealing centers in universities, renovation of kinder garden in university, procurement of books, and lab equipment for public universities. There have been 45 projects funded from HEDP. They have been at various stages of procurement, most of the projects have been awarded, contracts have been signed and are in the implementation process. The rest of them are under the procurement process. The list attached as annex xxx indicates that there are four projects not awarded yet since long period. These projects are as following:

- Library Books (24 Universities) => Rejected by NPC (National Procurement Committee) - Under Review (MoHE)
- Physics and Biology Kits (All Government Universities) => Under Review (MoHE)
- Lab equipment's (14 Universities) => Under Review (MoHE)
- Establishment of Creativity and Innovation Centers in KEU and KU

The above mentioned projects have been pending since long ago. The MoHE's senior leadership can discuss with NPA on the technical issue regarding library books. Based on president's decree, NPA suggested establishing a digital library instead of procuring library books. *The list of HEDP funded projects under procurements process are attached as annex 4.*

#### Physical Infrastructure Projects

The contract register sheet attached as annex 5 indicates that there have been 69 projects awarded to various contractors since 2016. From this number of projects, seven contractors have been paid 100%, while the others are still not paid, though the physical work of some have already been reported as 100% completed.

Out of the 14 ongoing large infrastructure projects, 6 projects have been completed, while three other projects are very close to the completion standing above 90%. The rest of projects are at various stages of

the implementation. The amended dates of the project indicate that majority of the projects need time extensions and amendments to their contracts.

The following are some of the reasons that cause delay to the implementation of infrastructure projects:

1. Those projects which need contracts amendments, get stuck in the MoHE. The contracts amendment process is lengthy and slow.
2. Low coordination among the key stakeholders of the projects (local provincial governance, line Ministries)
3. Security problems in some of the provinces
4. Lack of standard and well qualified companies. The bidders provide low price to win the project, but in the implementation phase, they make procrastinations, and challenge the program with their irrational claim. Most qualified companies don't offer low prices.
5. Lengthy procurement process of the government. Many projects go to the second and third round of announcements.

Table 7: the physical progress of infrastructure projects, updated by July 2019.

S / N	Project Name	Start Date	Amended End Date	Vendor Name	Contract Amount	Paid Amount	Financial Progress (%)	Physical Progress (%)	Remaining Amount	Remarks
1	Dormitories for female Students (Bamyan Province)	31-Aug-16	1-Feb-19	Afghan Bam and Shah Foladi CC	AFA 103,518,114	AFA 101,053,456	98%	100%	AFA 2,464,658	
2	Dormitories for female Students (Konar Province)	20-Dec-16	21-Dec-18	Upgrade CC	AFA 91,230,989	AFA 84,232,491	92.3%	100%	AFA 6,998,498	
3	Lecture Blocks with Large class rooms and small class rooms (Ghazni Provin)	26-Sep-16	26-Sep-18	Faizi Mujadidi CC	AFA 74,587,561	AFA 69,823,738	93.6%	93%	AFA 4,763,823	The contract extension is under process, once the firm receive the extension they will start the physical work
4	Lecture Blocks with Large class rooms and small class rooms (Sare-pul Prov)	17-Dec-16	6-Aug-19	Faizi Mujadidi CC	AFA 61,406,134	AFA 36,782,463	59.9%	65%	AFA 24,623,671	
5	Lecture Blocks with Large class rooms and small class rooms (Logar Province)	29-Dec-16	26-Feb-19	Dora CC	AFA 63,364,220	AFA 53,133,725	83.9%	80%	AFA 10,230,495	Due to the technical issues raised, the physical work is stopped
6	Establishment of Research Center (Kabul University)	18-Dec-16	17-Sep-17	Knowledge CC	AFA 23,645,899	AFA 14,176,236	60.0%	95%	AFA 9,469,663	The work progress is delayed due to the contractor
7	Establishment of Research Center (Kandahar University)	20-Feb-17	19-Nov-18	Lal Mohammad Maihan CC	AFA 22,284,009	AFA 20,205,611	90.7%	90%	AFA 2,078,398	
8	Dormitories for female Students (Helmand Province)	5-Jun-17	10-Jun-19	Hayat Heldmandwall CC	AFA 39,287,297	AFA 33,170,105	48.4%	90%	AFA 6,117,192	
9	Dormitories for female Students (Takhar Province)	26-Jul-17	09- Mar-19	Madian CC	AFA 36,352,667	AFA 24,587,427	67.6%	100%	AFA 11,765,240	
10	Lecture Blocks with Large class rooms and small class rooms (Parwan Prov)	11-Jul-17	11-Oct-18	Zahid Paktin CC	AFA 42,564,425	AFA 40,454,225	95.0%	100%	AFA 2,110,200	
11	Establishment of Research Center (Herat University)	12-Aug-17	30-Sep-18	Ezat Nasiri CC	AFA 21,331,140	AFA 18,967,495	88.9%	100%	AFA 2,363,645	Handover processed
12	Lecture Blocks with Large class rooms and small class rooms (Wardak Prov)	3-Oct-17	31-Dec-18	Best Star CC	AFA 43,995,740	AFA 26,469,125	60.2%	60%	AFA 17,526,615	The physical progress is stopped due to the security concerns in the area
13	Lecture Blocks with Large class rooms and small class rooms (Laghman Prov)	5-Aug-17	4-Nov-18	Nawy Sadat CC	AFA 42,401,201	AFA 41,470,092	97.8%	100%	AFA 931,109	Handover processed
14	Dormitories for female Students (Badghis Province)	31-Aug-16	22-09-18	-	-	-	0	30%	-	

## Financial Management

During the period under review, the FM team of the program was engaged in the process of receiving allotments, executing payments and updating the QuickBooks. Following tables and figures outline the budget execution rates at various program themes.

Table 8: Budget Execution Figures of the Program Fiscal Year 2019 as of August 2019

Grant	Budget	Expenditure	Expenditure (\$)	% Spent	Balance	Remarks
ARTF- Component 1	\$ 9,408,602.15	AFA 148,600,394	\$ 1,819,145.00	21.2%	\$ 7,589,457.15	
ARTF- Component 2	\$ 2,056,451.61	AFA 65,072,343	\$ 842,460.34	42.5%	\$ 1,213,991.27	
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 11,465,053.76</b>	<b>AFA 213,672,737</b>	<b>\$ 2,661,605.34</b>	<b>25.0%</b>	<b>\$ 8,803,448.42</b>	

## Financial Figures of Constriction Projects

All the constructions projects are being procured by MoHE's procurement department through GORIA's procurement law and have been directly supervised by the MoHE technical teams. The budget for this component has been estimated and embedded into the first component of the program. Since the start of the program the procurement department awarded 73 contracts that their list is attached along the report.

## Financial Figures on Scholarships

As per PIM and Grant Agreement, the expenditure of this part has been reported through IUFRR and all the reported have been cleared so far. The program has placed 304 academic members in priority degree programs. *The payment on scholarships has been shown in the annex 6.*

## Financial Figures on Research Projects

There hasn't been financial progress in respect to the research projects in the last two months. As per the GA, this theme of the program has been financed from the second or Non-DLI component of the program. The budget has been estimated USD100,000 for the completion of the research projects since the start of the program for each year. The program has awarded 100 researches and their payments have been cleared so far according to their progress report. In 2016 the estimated budget was USD100,000 but 40% of their certified work had been paid and the remaining was carry forwarded to next fiscal, this scenario is applicable in the rest of the years too. The following table indicates the budget execution against the research projects.

Table 9: Research Projects Payment Tracker

S.No	Fiscal Year	Planned Research Projects	Estimated Budget	Paid Amount	Remarks
1	2016	30	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 40,871.41	
2	2017	30	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 110,112.31	
3	2018	40	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 69,407.70	
4	2019	30	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 39,890.00	

## Human Resource Management

During the last two reporting period, the program experienced high turnover. Several team member of the program left HEDP for elsewhere due to better opportunities, and seeking migration abroad. The OMST

director, Senior Auditor, HR Specialist, HR officer, Senior finance officer and Logistic Assistant positions have been the new addition to the vacant positions. The human resource management of program continued on filling the vacant position and extension of the contracts of existed employees. During the reporting period following positions have been at various processes of recruitments.

Table 10: The positions in the recruitment processes during the last two months.

S/N	Name of Position	Recruitment Process				Expected date to get onboard
		Announced/Re-announced	Test and Interview Conducted	NoL with WB	On board	
1	Social safeguard specialist	√	√	√		Mid-September
2	University Operations Coordinator (Parwan, KEU, Bamyar and Badakhshan)	√	√			Mid October
3	Data Management Officer	√	√			End-September
4	Curriculum Development Advisor	√				TBC soon
5	ToR (Technical Coordination Specialist) for DM Office	√	√			Mid-September
6	Technical Assistant (Foreigners affairs directorate)	√	√	√	√	
7	Senior Internal Auditor	√	√			End of August
8	OMST Director	√				
9	HR Specialist	√				
10	HR Officer	√				
11	Logistic Assistant	√				
12	Senior Finance Officer	√	√	√		
13	4 Interns	√				

### Monitoring and Evaluation

During the reporting period, The M&E team continued to collect data on the progress of program indicators, and provide insight to the program management for the informed decision making. In addition, the M&E team prepared the ToR for TPV 2020. After the receipt of NoL from WB, the recruitment will be initiated. It's expected that the firm will be procured by December 2019.

The M&E team as assigned for the short term technical and maintenance trainings have had a tremendous progress in this regard. The trainings were pending since last three years. During this reporting period, an 8-day short term libraries and maintenance training was conducted at ACKU, Kabul university. 166 participants from 24 public universities and 9 higher education institutes attended the training. the report will be shared soon. The M&E team as well made all necessary arrangements for the second trainings which was conducted on 14-24 July 2019. In this training, 153 lab technicians were trained in five disciplines.

### D) Challenges and Recommendations

- The program is challenged by the delay in payments happening for almost several projects funded by HEDP. The contract management has been the main reason to the delay. As this was discussed in the last mission and agreed that the contract management should be significantly improved in terms of the technical issues related to the contracts and invoices, it still looks a challenge for the program.
- Almost three quarters of the fiscal year 2019 have been passed, the budget execution rate standing at 25% seems very low. The contract register (Annex 5) indicates that the program is due for almost 200 Million AFS equivalent to USD 2.6 Million. This due is associated with those contracts which have been expired; some of them need amendment (time extension) as the physical work is not completed 100%. The program to discuss with the relevant directorates at the MoHE to accelerate

the invoices and other process. The contracts should as well be pushed to submit their invoices on regular time bases and manage their contracts so that they can complete the projects within the agreed timelines.

- Based on the findings of the MSI two deviations will require additional costs for rectifications. The minimum cost has been estimated to be 7 million AFS. The MoHE should seek the budget from the development budget of the Ministry or discuss with WB if there are any opportunities from the HEDP budget. The ministry can seek other alternatives too, which can cost lower than this, or rectifying without any budget. Still a valid finding since last three reports.
- Three agreed actions associated to the social safeguard of the program need more attention and strict follow up. Apart from the Banyan issue, which is dependent on the ARAZI and Ministry of urban and housing internal process; the two other agreed actions can be met achieved soon before the WB mission. The program needs to accelerate the efforts.
- The program is challenged by the delay happened in the implementation of ongoing infrastructure projects. The amended dates of the projects indicate that almost all projects contracts are terminated by now, while there are a significant number of the projects which are not completed yet.

Annex A: Intermediate Outcome Indicators Status for 2019 based on the revised PIM

<i>Indicator</i>	<i>2019 Targets</i>	<i>Current Status as August 2019</i>
<b>A. Project Development Indicators</b>		
1. Student enrollment in universities in priority degree programs for economic development	Total: 80,500 Males: 65,000 Females: 15,500	Total: <b>81,984</b> Males: <b>65,049</b> Females: <b>16,935</b>
2. Number of universities developing, implementing and monitoring strategic five year rolling institutional development plans consistent with the National Higher Education Strategic Plan.	14 universities issue Strategic Institutional Development Plans according to the template	<b>13</b> universities issued Strategic Institutional Development Plans according to the template. By the end of 2019, this number will significantly increase.
3. Increased numbers of full time academic staff with at least a Master's degree in priority degree programs	1,300.00	<b>1700</b> with 225 females and 1465 males by April 2019
<b>A. Intermediate Outcome Indicators</b>		
Female enrollment in priority degree programs in the 1st year of public universities [DLI 1]	<b>5,000 by end of December 2018</b>	More than <b>5,348</b> first year female students are enrolled.
Number of female students with access to adequate residential facilities for women on university campuses	4,250	<b>3,953</b> by Aug 2019
Number of full time academic staff trained in, and practicing, outcome-based education and student centered learning [DLI 2]	750 academic staff trained in and practicing outcome-based education and student centered learning	1,819 academic staff have been trained and verified. While 1,200 academic staff practice OBE and SCL by the end of 2018.
Number of public universities with functional ICT centers for ICT based higher education [DLI 3]	<b>4 universities with new and functional ICT centers</b>	Based on the TPV report <b>five</b> ICTs have been reported functional. Seven ICTs established.
Number of scholarships awarded to full time faculty staff for Masters Degrees in priority disciplines [DLI 4]	450 scholarships awarded	<b>477 scholarships awarded.</b> 424 Master degree scholarships awarded; 53 PhD Scholarships awarded. 114 master scholarships completed and returned
Number of technical staff completing short-term technical and maintenance courses	250 staff trained	<b>446</b> technical staff trained
Number of universities with Internal Quality Assurance Units (IQAUs) (b) functioning to international standards [DLI 5]	<b>6 universities with IQAUs functioning to international standards</b>	Based on the TPV report, <b>6</b> IQAUs reported functional. 9 IQAUs established.

Number of public and private universities which complete a new regionally benchmarked quality assurance cycle	External institutional quality assurance reviews completed for 15 public and 15 private universities and reports disseminated by the MoHE	14 publics and 15 private universities externally reviewed.
Number of university senior managerial and administrative staff completing short-term leadership and management courses in the context of greater authority and accountability	275 staff trained	245 Senior Academic Staff trained,
Development oriented research Projects, mainly in the priority disciplines [DLI # 6]	<p>10 new group research Projects commenced</p> <p>20 new individual research Projects commenced</p> <p>At least 25 group research Projects completed</p> <p>At least 50 individual research Projects completed</p>	<p>12 New research projects awarded,</p> <p>42 Individual research projects awarded</p> <p>18 Group research projects of 2017 completed</p> <p>35 Individual research projects of 2017 completed</p>